

Thriving Against the Democratic Backdrop: Black Women's Leadership, Racial Justice, and the Reimagining of PK-12 Schooling

Rhema Yvonne Stradford-Dai
University of Southern California

Abstract: Black women educational leaders occupy a paradoxical position in PK-12 schooling. Frequently called upon to lead during periods of complexity, equity initiatives, and organizational transformation, Black women often do so while navigating racialized and gendered norms that undermine their authority, intensify their emotional labor, and constrain their professional advancement. Drawing on a phenomenological study of Black women lower school principals working in independent schools, I construct a research method that positions Black women's leadership as a critical lens through which to assess democratic failures and democratic possibilities of schooling.

Research grounded in Black feminist theory, misogynoir theory, constructive-developmental theory, democratic education, affective neuroscience, and decolonial thought reveals how Black women who are school leaders resist anti-Blackness, white supremacy, and gendered racism while cultivating liberatory, community-centered approaches to leadership (Dai, 2025). Their experiences demonstrate how schools often reproduce anti-democratic patterns such as exclusion, gatekeeping, inequitable access to power, and devaluation of culturally rooted ways of knowing. At the same time, leadership practices of Black women illuminate alternative futures for education grounded in relationality, justice, and transformative possibility. Seeing Black women in leadership roles in this clarifying light repositions scholarly understanding of Black women as leaders. Black women are not exceptional figures who survive hostile systems, but visionary architects of more humane, democratic, and liberatory educational environments. Black women educational leaders in PK-12 schools, particularly in early childhood and elementary settings, enact justice-oriented leadership while navigating institutional environments shaped by misogynoir and structural inequity. Black women's leadership experiences expose both the fractures and the unrealized possibilities of democracy in education. Black women leaders often encounter diminished authority, isolation, tokenism, and heightened scrutiny. Yet they also cultivate forms of leadership embedded in cultural knowledge, relational trust, communal care, spiritual grounding, and liberatory imagination. Their experiences therefore reveal not only what educational institutions fail to provide, but also what schools might become when leadership is rooted in equity, dignity, and collective flourishing.

Black Women's Leadership: A Conceptual Framework

To study the complex lives of Black women school administrators adequately, I've constructed an interdisciplinary conceptual framework that integrates Black feminist theory, misogynoir theory, constructive-developmental theory, democratic education, decolonial thought, and affective neuroscience. Together, these perspectives provide a robust analytic lens for understanding the lived experiences of Black women educational leaders in PK-12 settings, particularly in independent schools. At the center of this framework is the understanding that Black women's leadership experiences cannot be adequately interpreted through race-only or gender-only analyses. Rather, Black women navigate educational leadership through the confluence of race, gender, power, culture, and institutional hierarchy. Their experiences reveal the ways schools reproduce inequitable systems while also illuminating possibilities for more

democratic, humane, and liberatory educational futures (Dai, 2025). A synthesis of theoretical orientations is required to begin to understand adequately the complicated professional lives of Black women who are school leaders. The theories I discuss in this section combine to give us insight into the general social context in which Black women school leaders work (Black Feminist Theory, Misogynoir Theory), the opportunities for growth at work (Constructive-Developmental Theory), and the aims of growth for the institutions they lead and the profession of educational leadership (Democratic Education and Decolonial Thought, Affective Neuroscience and Human Development).

Black Feminist Theory: Although aware and respectful of the imbricate nature of the many chauvinisms faced by Black women in educational leadership positions, Black feminist theory serves as the central interpretive lens of my study's conceptual framework. The framework positions Black women's lived experiences as legitimate and necessary sources of knowledge (Collins, 2000; Cooper, 1892/1988; Crenshaw, 1989; Smith, 1983). Black feminist theory argues that Black women occupy a distinctive social location shaped by intersecting forms of oppression, including racism, sexism, classism, and other forms of marginalization (Collins, 2000; Crenshaw, 1989). These intersecting systems influence how Black women are perceived, treated, and positioned within institutions. In educational leadership, these dynamics often manifest through diminished authority, hypervisibility *and* invisibility, tokenism, isolation, and the expectation that Black women perform extensive emotional and relational labor without adequate support. At the same time, Black feminist theory emphasizes that Black women are not solely defined by oppression. Their leadership reflects resistance, creativity, relationality, spirituality, and communal care. Black women leaders often cultivate culturally grounded approaches that center dignity, trust, and collective flourishing. Their experiences therefore offer critical insight into how schools can be transformed into more equitable and life-giving spaces.

Misogynoir Theory: 'Misogynoir theory' deepens Black feminist analysis by naming the specific form of anti-Black, gendered oppression directed toward Black women. Coined by Moya Bailey (2013, 2021), misogynoir describes the intersection of misogyny and anti-Black racism that uniquely shapes Black women's experiences. Within educational leadership, misogynoir may appear through tone policing, racialized assumptions about competence, excessive scrutiny, invisibilization of expertise, exclusion from informal networks, and persistent questioning of Black women's legitimacy as leaders. Black women leaders are often expected to be strong but not "too strong," caring but not "too emotional," assertive but not "too aggressive." These ambiguous, if not downright contradictory expectations create impossible standards and intensify the emotional burden of leadership. Importantly, misogynoir is not limited to individual interactions. It is embedded within institutional norms, hiring practices, leadership pipelines, mentorship structures, and definitions of professionalism that privilege whiteness and masculinity. Misogynoir theory helps illuminate how schools can systematically marginalize Black women while still professing commitments to diversity, equity, and inclusion.

Constructive-Developmental Theory (CDT): Constructive-developmental theory, particularly the work of Robert Kegan (1994, 2000) and Eleanor Drago-Severson (2009, 2012), provides a framework for understanding how leaders make meaning of complex experiences. Adults continue to grow and evolve throughout their lives, developing increasingly sophisticated ways of understanding themselves, others, and the systems in which they work. CDT also offers an important counter-narrative to assumptions about adult development: Adults can continue to develop more expansive, justice-oriented ways of knowing as they grow older. A concept central

to CDT is the idea of “holding environments,” or relational and organizational structures that support adults as they navigate challenge, complexity, and growth (Drago-Severson, 2012; Drago-Severson & Blum-DeStefano, 2018). Effective holding environments provide a balance of support and stretch, allowing leaders to engage difficult realities while remaining connected to a sense of purpose and possibility. Schools can intentionally cultivate holding environment leadership structures that support growth in leadership capacity, especially for those whose identities and experiences have historically been marginalized. But the organizational reality in schools for Black women leaders is a far cry from a holding environment. For Black women leaders, the absence of holding environments can be especially harmful. Participants in a study of Black women school leaders working in independent schools frequently described leading during episodes of racialized conflict, institutional resistance, and organizational instability without access to meaningful mentorship, developmental/emotional support/scaffolding, or affirming leadership structures (Dai, 2025). Constructive-developmental theory therefore helps explain not only the external barriers Black women face, but also the internal work required to sustain themselves within inequitable systems.

Democratic Education and Decolonial Thought: Democratic education and decolonial thought further situate Black women school leaders within broader questions about the purpose of schooling and the meaning of educational leadership. Democratic education suggests that schools should serve as spaces where all people are treated with dignity, where multiple ways of knowing are valued, and where communities participate meaningfully in decision-making (Dewey, 1916; Freire, 1970). Yet schools frequently reproduce anti-democratic practices through exclusion, gatekeeping, surveillance, and biased access to power. Decolonial scholars, such as Vanessa de Oliveira Andreotti (2016), challenge educational institutions to interrogate the assumptions, hierarchies, and desires that shape dominant models of leadership and schooling. Andreotti's work is particularly useful for understanding how educational systems often privilege rigid, white-centered definitions of professionalism, authority, and success while marginalizing relational, communal, and culturally grounded forms of leadership. Together, democratic and decolonial perspectives help frame Black women's leadership not as a deviation from dominant norms, but as a genuinely generative alternative to the way things currently are. Black women leaders frequently enact leadership practices rooted in care, relational trust, collective responsibility, and cultural responsiveness. These practices model democratic and liberatory possibilities for schools.

Affective Neuroscience and Human Development: Recent scholarship in affective neuroscience and human development further strengthens this conceptual framework by emphasizing that learning, growth, and leadership are deeply relational, intensely emotional, and personally embodied processes. Scholars such as Mary Helen Immordino-Yang (2015; Immordino-Yang et al., 2024) argue that people do not learn or lead through cognition alone. Human development is shaped by belonging, emotional safety, cultural context, identity, and the quality of relationships. Schools that ignore these realities often undermine the very outcomes they seek to produce. For Black women leaders, this insight is especially important. Chronic exposure to racial stress, tokenism, isolation, and emotional labor can have significant developmental and physiological consequences. At the same time, environments characterized by trust, affirmation, care, and meaningful support can foster resilience, agency, and transformational growth.

A Prism through which to See the Light

Constructive-Development Theory shows us that adults continue to grow even as they age. Thus, what we see emerge from study of Black women school leaders is patterns of growth in difficult circumstances. Chief among those difficulties are anti-Black racism and misogynoir considered as social structures. What we can most importantly learn from Black women school leaders' positive growth in hostile circumstances is how to create working conditions that foster even more profoundly positive growth. Educational institutions must move beyond deficit-oriented approaches and instead cultivate conditions in which Black women leaders can thrive. Participants in an interview study of Black women school administrators emphasized the importance of mentorship, inclusive hiring practices, affirming leadership pipelines, and holding environments that recognize the complexity of Black women's leadership experiences (Dai, 2025). Taken together, — Affective Neuroscience and Human Development, Black Feminist Theory, Constructive-Developmental Theory, Misogynoir Theory, and Democratic Education and Decolonial Thought — these frameworks create a conceptual foundation for understanding Black women's leadership as both a site of struggle and a site, possibly, of victory. Black women leaders expose the contradictions within educational institutions that, for instance, claim to value equity; but, that, all the while, maintain structures that marginalize Black women. At the same time, Black women in positions of authority also model new ways of leading that are relational, liberatory, developmentally grounded, and deeply democratic. Rather than positioning Black women as exceptional individuals who survive hostile systems, the conceptual framework constructed here recognizes Black women as visionary leaders whose experiences can help reimagine the future of schooling. The Black Women's Leadership Conceptual Framework is a multi-faceted prism through which to discern the refracted components of lived experience that Black women school leaders conjoin into a guiding light.

References

- Andreotti, V. de O. (2016). (Re)imagining education as an un-coercive re-arrangement of desires. *Other Education: The Journal of Educational Alternatives*, 5(1), 79–88.
- Bailey, M. (2013). Misogynoir transformed: Black women's digital resistance. *The Feminist Wire*.
- Bailey, M. (2021). *Misogynoir transformed: Black women's digital resistance*. New York University Press.
- Collins, P. H. (2000). *Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment* (2nd ed.). Routledge.
- Cooper, A. J. (1988). *A voice from the South*. Oxford University Press. (Original work published 1892)
- Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A Black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory and antiracist politics. *University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 1989(1), 139–167.
- Dewey, J. (1916). *Democracy and education*. Macmillan.
- Drago-Severson, E. (2009). *Leading adult learning: Supporting adult development in our schools*. Corwin.
- Drago-Severson, E. (2012). *Helping educators grow: Strategies and practices for leadership development*. Harvard Education Press.
- Drago-Severson, E., & Blum-DeStefano, J. (2018). *Tell me so I can hear you: A developmental approach to feedback for educators*. Harvard Education Press.

- Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. Continuum.
- Immordino-Yang, M. H. (2015). *Emotions, learning, and the brain: Exploring the educational implications of affective neuroscience*. W. W. Norton.
- Immordino-Yang, M. H., Nasir, N. S., Cantor, P., & Yoshikawa, H. (2024). Weaving a colorful cloth: Centering education on humans' emergent developmental potentials. *Review of Research in Education*, 47, 1–45.
- Kegan, R. (1994). *In over our heads: The mental demands of modern life*. Harvard University Press.
- Kegan, R. (2000). What “form” transforms? A constructive-developmental approach to transformative learning. In J. Mezirow & Associates (Eds.), *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress* (pp. 35–69). Jossey-Bass.
- Smith, B. (1983). *Home girls: A Black feminist anthology*. Kitchen Table: Women of Color Press.
- Stradford-Dai, R. Y. S. (2025). *We see it, we want it, we dream it, we work hard, we THRIVE when we run it: Black female lower school principals thriving in independent schools* (Doctoral Dissertation, University of Southern California).
- .